

Yavapai College
District Governing Board
Regular Meeting

Tuesday, May 17, 2022

Immediately following adjournment of Budget Adoption Meeting (estimated time 1:30 p.m.)

Prescott Campus Community Room # 19-147
1100 E. Sheldon Drive
Prescott, Az. 86301

Members Present

Ms. Deb McCasland, Board Chair
Mr. Ray Sigafoos, Secretary
Mr. Paul Chevalier, Board Member
Mr. Mitch Padilla, Board Member
Mr. Chris Kuknyo, Board Member

Administration Present

Dr. Lisa B. Rhine, President
Atty. Lynne Adams, Board Attorney
Ms. Yvonne Sandoval, Executive Assistant
Mrs. Beckey Massey, Coordinator to the District Governing Board

MINUTES

<https://yavapai.hosted.panopto.com/Panopto/Pages/Viewer.aspx?id=a058714c-328e-4ef8-85cd-aea101546ff7>

1. General Functions: Procedural
 - a. Call to Order {Time: 1} (**Recording at: 49:14**)
Board Chair McCasland called the District Governing Board Regular Meeting to order at 1:48 p.m.
 - b. Pledge of Allegiance {Time: 1} (**Recording at 49:26**)
Member Mr. Kuknyo led the Pledge of Allegiance.
 - c. Adoption of Agenda – **DECISION** {Time: 1} (**Recording at: 50:02**)
Board Secretary Mr. Sigafoos asked to make an adjustment to the Meeting Agenda as published. He requested that his presentation to the District Governing Board Agenda be moved up to follow agenda item 2.e.

Mr. Sigafoos moved to adopt the agenda with the adjustment noted above. Member Padilla seconded the motion.

Member Mr. Chevalier made comments regarding his previous request for items to be placed on the agenda. (Recording at 50:02)

Board Secretary Mr. Sigafoos called for the vote to approve the agenda. The vote passed 4-1 (Ayes: McCasland, Sigafoos, Padilla, Kuknyo; Nay: Chevalier).

2. Study Session
 - a. President's Reports - Dr. Lisa Rhine - **INFORMATION** {Time: 60} (**Recording at 57:06**)

Dr. Rhine shared her appreciation to all those that helped with Graduation and recognized the number of graduates.
The Yavapai College Softball team was recognized and congratulated for making it to the national level. Dr. Rhine announced that the enrollments are up in comparison to last year.

 - i. College Council – Dr. Diane Ryan, Dr. Emily Weinacker, and Mr. Rodney Jenkins
 1. Faculty Senate – Dr. Karen Palmer (**Recording at: 1:00:01**)
 2. Staff Association – Shannon Johns and James Tobin (**Recording at: 1:03:25**)
 3. Student Government Association – Brian Moultrup, YCSGA President (**Recording at: 1:08:42**)
Andre Tucker, YCSGA Vice President, spoke on behalf of Brian Moultrup.
 - ii. 2022 Yavapai College Faculty Emeritus – Dr. Diane Ryan, Vice President of Academic Affairs **INFORMATION** (**Recording at: 1:17:25**)
 - iii. Yavapai College Legislative Report – Mr. Rodney Jenkins, Vice President of Community Relations, and Student Development **INFORMATION** (**Recording at: 1:22:56**)
 - iv. Budget to Actual Monthly Report and Cash Reserves Monthly Report **INFORMATION** (**Recording at: 1:31:28**)
 - c. Yavapai County-Wide Data and Yavapai College Academic Data Review, Dr. Diane Ryan, Vice President of Academic Affairs, and Dr. Clint Ewell, Vice President of Finance. **INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION** {Time: 15} (**Recording at: 1:32:08**)

Dr. Clint Ewell and Dr. Diane Ryan gave a presentation in response to a request from Member Padilla that the College provide data to help answer some of the questions that have been previously raised by Board members related to the Verde Valley. The presentation focused on occupations and growth in the entire county and on the east side of the county.
 - D. Yavapai College Space and Facility Rental – Dr. Clint Ewell, Vice President of Finance, **INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION** {Time: 15} (**Recording at: 1:39:56**)

Dr. Clint Ewell presented the Board with information that pertains to the college facility uses agreements in response to questions raised at a previous meeting by Board members pertaining to the use of the College's tennis/pickleball courts. Dr. Ewell discussed Board Policy 201, College Policies 6.05 and 6.06, and liability insurance issues.

Mr. Scott Farnsworth answered specific questions pertaining to how the process worked.

Board Business Item 3.c was moved to item 2.e by prior vote of the Board.

- e. **District Governing Board Minutes and Records - Mr. Ray Sigafoos, Board Secretary INFORMATION, DISCUSSION, AND POSSIBLE DECISION) {Time: 30} (Recording at: 1:49:30)**

Mr. Sigafoos spoke to the Board as the District Governing Board Secretary.

Member Chevalier believes that the minutes miss the “flavor” of the meeting because they do not include enough details.

Attorney Lynne Adams explained why the College switched to the recording method for capturing Board member comments and that this is a completely legal method with fewer mistakes and interpretations by the person creating the minutes.

Executive Assistant Yvonne Sandoval explained that Ryan Gray and herself have reviewed the storage process of the Yavapai College minutes. She explained this process to the Board, including all the places and methods for storing Board materials, including minutes.

Ryan Gray provided information regarding the recording, streaming and storage of Board meetings, including information about Panopto.

Secretary Sigafoos provided additional information about his views on this issue.

Member Padilla feels that based on the information provided by Attorney Adams, the current process is lawful and compliant, and that Yavapai College should explore the technology that is available and move away from paper.

Member Chevalier feels that it is important to mirror how the congressional record is drafted and that the Board Secretary should look over the minutes.

Dr. Rhine explained that more detailed minutes require a significant amount of time to prepare and were costly and resulted in disputes about whether Board members’ comments were accurately captured. Indicating that comments could be heard on a recording of the meeting allowed everyone to know what exactly was said. The College looked into creating verbatim minutes, including using a court reporter, but these options are way too costly. Secretary Sigafoos indicated that he was not in favor of verbatim minutes but thinks the pendulum has swung too far in the other direction.

Mr. Sigafoos asked that the document he presented be attached to the minutes. Mr. Sigafoos asked to revise and extend his remarks.

Chair McCasland suggests that this be moved to a future meeting for further discussion of options. Secretary Sigafoos indicated that he would be willing to get more involved in reviewing the minutes.

Chair McCasland moved item 3.a to be next on the agenda.

3. Board Business

- a. Yavapai College Baccalaureate Degree Presentation – Dr. Diane Ryan, Vice President of Academic Affairs. **INFORMATION, DISCUSSION, AND DECISION {Time:60} (Recording at: 2:39:00)**

Dr. Diane Ryan presented the Yavapai College Baccalaureate Degrees with Scott Farnsworth and Joni Fisher assisting. They provided information on the College’s work on offering baccalaureate degrees. The College will initially offer both a BAS (goal of Fall 2023) and a BSN (goal of Fall 2024).

Board member asked questions regarding both of the potential degree programs.

Dr. Rhine stated that Yavapai College will be the first rural College to offer Baccalaureate Degrees.

Board Secretary Sigafos moved to approve the College’s submission of the application to HLC to offer the two baccalaureate degrees as presented. Member Kuknyo seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously (Ayes: McCasland, Sigafos, Padilla, Kuknyo, Chevalier).

- b. Approval of naming “The Opal Allen’s Founders Foyer”- Mr. Rodney Jenkins, Vice President of Student Development and Community Affairs **INFORMATION, DISCUSSION, AND DECISION {Time:10} (Recording at: 3:14:00)**

Mr. Rodney Jenkins provided information regarding the history of Opal Allen and Yavapai College.

Board Chair McCasland moved to approve the naming of the Opal Allen’s Founders Foyer. Mr. Sigafos seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously (Ayes: McCasland, Sigafos, Padilla, Kuknyo, Chevalier).

- d. Consent Agenda – **DECISION {Time: 5} (Recording at: 3:17:58)**

- i. Board Regular Meeting Minutes – Tuesday, April 12, 2022 *(Attached)*
- ii. Receipt of Report on Revenues and Expenditures for March 2022 *(Attached)*
- iii. Yavapai College Summary of New Program and Deletions
 1. New - Emergency Medical Technician- Basic Certificate *(Attached)*
 2. Delete – Emergency Medical Technician Certificate *(Attached)*
 3. Delete – Canine Care and Handling Certificate *(Attached)*
 4. Delete - Service Dog Certificate *(Attached)*
 5. Delete – Therapy and Service Dog Team Skills Certificate *(Attached)*
- iv. Intergovernmental Agreement Sedona PAC Access with Sedona Oak Creek School-District
Board Member, Mr. Paul Chevalier requested that Consent Agenda items d.i and d.iv be pulled for further discussion.

Mr. Chevalier moved to approve the Consent Agenda with the exception of items d.i and d.iv being pulled for further discussion. Board Secretary

Sigafoos seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously (Ayes: McCasland, Sigafoos, Padilla, Kuknyo, Chevalier).

Consent Agenda Item d.i (Recording at: 3:19:05):

Mr. Chevalier moved that the following sentence be added to the minutes after the first sentence of the first paragraph. “Mr. Chevalier then requested that his item be placed on the May meeting agenda.” Mr. Padilla seconded the motion. The motion failed 2-3 (Ayes: Chevalier, Sigafoos; Nays: McCasland, Padilla, Kuknyo).

Consent Agenda Item d.iv (Recording at: 3:21:37):

Member Chevalier asked questions regarding the IGA with the Sedona Performing Arts Center and felt it should be re-written to be more precise, and Dr. Ewell provided some clarifications. Dr. Rhine explained that a delay in adopted the IGA would delay the College’s work in setting up programs with the Sedona Performing Arts Center.

Mr. Chevalier moved that this item be tabled to allow time for revisions of the IGA. Mr. Padilla seconded the motion. The motion failed 1-4 (Aye: Chevalier; Nays: Sigafoos, McCasland, Padilla, Kuknyo).

Mr. Sigafoos moved to approve the IGA with one minor spelling error to be corrected (the word “performing” in the document title). Chair McCasland seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-1 (Ayes: McCasland, Sigafoos, Padilla, Kuknyo; Nay: Chevalier).

Mr. Sigafoos moved to approve the minutes of the March 22, 2022, Board meeting. Mr. Kuknyo seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-1 (Ayes: McCasland, Sigafoos, Padilla, Kuknyo; Nay: Chevalier).

e. Board Liaisons’ Reports - INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION {Time: 10} (Recording at: 3:33:51)

- i. Board Spokesperson – Board Chair McCasland**
- ii. Arizona Association of Community College Trustee (AACCT) – Board Chair McCasland**
- iii. Yavapai College Foundation – Board Chair McCasland**

Chair McCasland provided updates on her work on all of these committees and her other work on behalf of the College.

f. Dates and Time of Future Meetings and Events - INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION {Time: 5} (Recording at: 3:40:15)

- i. 2021-2022 Dates, Times, and Places of Future Board Meetings, Workshops, and Retreats**
- ii. 2021-2022 Dates, Times, and Places of Future College Events**
- iii. 2021-2022 Dates, Times, and Places of Future National, State, and Local Conferences**

3. Adjournment of Board Regular Meeting: Procedural - **DECISION** {Time: 1} (**Recording at: 3:42:03**)

Mr. Sigafos moved to adjourn the meeting at 4:52 p.m. The motion passed unanimously 5-0 (Ayes: McCasland, Sigafos, Padilla, Kuknyo, Chevalier).

Meeting Adjourned: 4:52 p.m.

Respectfully submitted:


Yvonne Sandoval, Recording Secretary

9/30/2022
Date


Ms. Deb McCasland, Board Chair


Mr. Ray Sigafos, Secretary

I am speaking to you today as the Secretary of the Board. The job of the Board Secretary is not to take the minutes but rather to assure that the minutes reflect the actions of the Board in sufficient detail that a person looking at them in the future will know how and WHY decisions were made.

I am a historian by avocation. My real job deals with history in a financial sense. My passion is real history.

Apropos to the question of minutes for our meetings:

"... newspapers are making ... the rough draft of history. Later, the historian will come, take down the old files, and transform the crude but sincere and accurate annals of editors and reporters into history. . ."

1905 - The State (Columbia, SC)

What is really important about that quotation is that it refers to reviewing old files. In 1905 that would have been files created and stored on paper.

Paper has been used throughout recorded history. The term refers to wood pulp rather than parchment or vellum which are made from animal skins. Papyrus, a predecessor of paper was used in Egypt more than 4,000 years ago. Refined paper is a post 1000 CE product.

The Missal of Silos is the oldest known document on paper (as opposed to parchment) created in Europe; it dates to around

1080 AD. It is a codex of the liturgy of an extinct Catholic sect in Spain. It is held in a library in Burgos Spain.

The Magna Carta, signed by King John in 1215, was printed on parchment. It is on display in Canterbury Cathedral.

Why am I focusing the discussion on paper documents? We live in a digital age.

I totally understand the digital age we live in.

I built my first computer in 1977. It was a Heathkit H8. During the 1980's in addition to my accounting practice I owned a company that made and sold IBM PC clones. I also dabbled in programming, mostly in BASIC and dBASE. In 1994 my partners and I created the second Internet service provider in Prescott. It was called Lancaster. We sold out to a publicly traded company on 2000 since we couldn't compete with local cable company for Internet speeds and network size.

In 1992 I created the local area network for my office. It had 10 workstations and peripherals. The successor to that network is still in use today. The original coax cable has been changed to CAT5 and the architecture has evolved. I designed it and am the network administrator.

I understand the digital world we live in today.

I recently finished writing a book about the early history of ERAU from 1978 through 1998. The period in question included 1993, the year that the new president at ERAU led an effort to close the Prescott campus. His reasoning was based largely on a flawed budget allocation module that didn't assign costs between the Daytona Beach and Prescott campuses on a realistic basis. There was a lot more to it than that but the bottom line is that history of a near death experience for the Prescott campus was largely forgotten by the current leadership of the University.

“Those who cannot remember the past are condemned to repeat it” George Santayana - 1905

The source documents that I used for the year 1993 consisted of paper documents -- the extensive minutes of the Board, the Finance Committee, and the Executive Committee, the two campus exploratory committees and various internal memos from the President's office. They still exist in the archives of ERAU and are retrievable, albeit by hand. Converted to pdfs they were able to be used by me in my efforts. Without those records my efforts would have rested on my memory and the memories of my colleagues who served with me at that time. Since I finished my efforts last November two of my colleagues have died and their memories are gone. It was fortuitous that I was able to complete my project using their help.

But the real key was the written minutes that survived in the archives. The minutes were not quite verbatim but were more

than "a question was raised, there was a discussion and the action (whatever) was taken."

Or worse "An item was discussed and voted on. To see what happened point your browser to a site and review a tape of the 4-hour meeting. The section in question was at 2:45 in the meeting."

The Board challenge at YC is to decide what kind of minutes we want and how do we protect them?

Several years ago, I was searching for minutes of meetings in the 1970's that dealt with the adoption of the budgets. The Administration was able to provide copies of those minutes and budget documents in pdf format. I don't know whether the documents had to be scanned to pdfs or if the archive exists in electronic form. I know that at that time the archive was stored locally.

For a period of time from the late 2000s through last year we stored some or all of the Board documents in a software database that was located in Canada. There were issues with that database including latency and format issues. The main, and final, issue was the cost to maintain the database. We stopped the subscription to that database. We saved the annual maintenance cost. Hopefully before we departed Canada, we were able to retrieve the Board documents.

So where am I going with this? My premises are the following:

1. Minutes and other Board documents need to be stored under our control, hopefully locally. There is no substitute for the retrieval of our history in a convenient form. Board documents need to be easy for members and the public to access, whether they are minutes, budgets, monitoring reports, or the like.

2. Minutes need to be taken in a manner that reflects the activity of the Board and that reflects the actions of the Board, including at least a summary of various comments. Detailed discussions are not required to be saved or memorialized. They are not required. Discussions that take several minutes and are back and forth are very cumbersome to track.

As an example: "X said that (whatever). Y interjected that (whatever) is not needed or wanted. Z supported X in (whatever) but added (some more stuff)" Where "whatever" is a long and involved speech outlining a position and the entire discussion covers much ground. It is my opinion that a summary is sufficient with the parties identified and the general nature of the back and forth is captured. This is how the ERAU minutes were crafted.

3. Storing meeting video tapes on an external server somewhere is not a substitute for minutes. It may be technically legal to take the minutes in that fashion but there are inherent dangers.

First the published minutes of March 2022 (the first meeting to use video exclusively) contains a supposed hyperlink to the minutes video.

That link is NOT LIVE. That means that the link is not clickable to get to the video. At least in my browser it is not even possible to copy the link using my cursor. In order to access the video, the public (or Board member) needs to print out the page and hand copy the link in a new browser window.

WHAT?

Secondly is the stability of the storage facility. The company that was chosen to host the videos is Panopto.com. Who are they and how do we access them 10 years from now?

Fast facts from their website:

#3 among medium sized companies in Pittsburg.

170 employees in six offices - worldwide

A scrappy startup.

4. The difference between a local and a cloud storage system is that a local backup is on your hard disk – a cloud backup is on someone else's hard disk. Why?

The Board needs to take a policy position on this matter. Does the Board believe that:

- a. Minutes do not need to reflect the actions in summary but merely refer to some video stored somewhere?

For example, from the March minutes

“item 3.a District Governing Board Budget – Dr Clint Ewell – {time 10} recording at 3:00 Member Sigafos moved, seconded by member Padilla to approve the District budget as prepared. The motion passed 4-1 – Nay – Chevalier”

What happened?

The timeline went from 1:43 for the prior item - preliminary capital budget with the Smith Group - to the above item at 3:00 and 10 minutes were spent on discussing the overall budget and voting on it?

- b. A storage system not located locally is preferred to a storage system that we control in my opinion. Remember Canada.